

Incivility Experienced by Nursing Students in Clinical Settings: A Literature Review

YOUNGLEE KIM, PHD, RN
NURSING FACULTY AT CALIFORNIA STATE
UNIVERSITY, SAN BERNARDINO

MIRELLA ARANA, SN; MICHAEL MUELA, SN, EMT-P;
ELIZABETH TAMEZ, SN; & JASMINE ZEPEDA, SN,

CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, SAN BERNARDINO,
DEPARTMENT OF NURSING



Purpose

- ▶ Review the existing data on incivility experienced by nursing students during clinical education
- ▶ **Key Terms**
 - ▶ Incivility – Behaviors that violates social norms including rudeness, intentional isolation, dismissiveness, hostility and disregard (Andersson & Pearson, 1999; Clark & Kenaley, 2011)
 - ▶ Nursing Students – Focus on persons engaged in pre-licensure nursing education
 - ▶ Clinical Education – Learning setting that exists within patient care environments under the direction of practicing nursing personnel
- ▶ The American Nurses Association (ANA) Code of Ethics assigns nurses the responsibility for cultivating an ethically competent workplace and identifies students as key stakeholders (2015).

Background

Clinical experience has been a longstanding part of nursing education

(Spector, 2009)

It provides exposure to clients and skills

(Brennan, McSherry, 2007)

Students begin process of professional socialization

- Begin to professional role expectations and behaviors



Problems

Faculty at CSUSB have reported student concerns about treatment by hospital personnel during clinical

Rudeness and dismissive actions are commonly cited issues (Thomas, Jinks, & Jacks, 2015)

Students that are victims of incivility were found to develop cynicism and emotional exhaustion (Babenko-Mould & Laschinger, 2014)



Methods

- ▶ **Search Engines:** EBSCOhost Academic Search Premier, and PubMed
- ▶ **Key words:** “*nursing student,*” “*incivility,*” “*rudeness,*” and “*clinical practice.*”
- ▶ **Searching Process:** Peer reviewed articles were written in the English language between the year 2007-2017
- ▶ **Data collection:** February 28, 2018 — March 21, 2018.
- ▶ Among the 82 only 7 Articles were identified for the Literature Review
- ▶ Table was used to document this process

Methods (continued)

Research Articles
Total of 88 Articles

#	TITLE OF ARTICAL	YES, NO, MAYBE
1	“A bi-national survey of clinical faculty members' experiences with student incivility.”	No. Doesn't seem like it is about students.
2	“Decreasing workplace incivility.”	No. About incivility in hospital workplace. Not associated with nursing students.
3	“Becoming inclusive: A code of conduct for inclusion and diversity.”	No. More about diversity in nursing profession.
4	Nursing Students' Experiences with Incivility in Clinical Education.	Yes. Talks about incivility in clinical setting. It's a qualitative study.
5	임상실습 중 간호대학생이 경험하는 무례함, 소진, 전공만족도 및 자기효능감과의 관계	No. Not in English.
6	Student Perceptions of INCIVILITY in Nursing Education: Implications for Educators.	Yes. If it can include incivility in classroom and clinical setting.
7	Nursing Graduates' Ability to Address Incivility: Kirkpatrick's Level-3 Evaluation.	No. About graduate students.
	An Intervention to Promote Civility Among Nursing Students.	Maybe. Need further review. It's about civility within nursing students. Not sure if it's in the clinical setting.

2-28-18 meeting

1. Reviewed search engines to find articles from peer reviewed journals that were published by 2007-2017. Anything related to the key terms of nursing students and incivility or rudeness and clinical setting.
2. First meeting discuss possible research topic and research method
 - Has to be incivility in the CLINICAL SETTING, NOT THE CLASSROOM!!!!
 - Just read through the abstracts and see if the article is related to the topic we have.

Reviewed search engines to find articles from peer reviewed journals that were published by 2007-2017. Anything related to the key terms of nursing student and incivility or rudeness and clinical setting.

Sum total of articles found was 82.

3-7-18 meeting

It's incivility toward student in clinical setting. For example, doctor, student, nurses, faculty staff, family, etc. (anyone) is rude to the student.

Has to be published in English.

Doesn't matter what country. Can be anywhere.

Discussed the criteria for each article we are going to use

1. Has to be in a clinical
2. Students and professor determined what criteria needed to be met to have articles included in research.

3-21-18 meeting

From 1:30-3:05

Findings

	Author	Article	Instrument Validated	Sample Characteristic	Outcome
1	Anthony and Yastik (2011)	"Nursing Students' Experiences with Incivility in Clinical Education"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Used a questionnaire Qualitative research 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Private Midwestern University 21 volunteer participants 18 females and 3 males 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incivility has affected students in the clinical setting by impacting self-confidence and attitude towards future career. Three behavioral themes that were identified were: "hostile or rude," "exclusionary," and "dismissive." Positive experience occur when students were included. Students believe that school faculty cannot change incivility from occurring.
2	Altmiller (2012)	"Student Perceptions of Incivility in Nursing Education: Implications for Educators"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Questionnaires were used during the four focus groups and students responses were documented 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 24 BSN students 1 state university and 3 private universities in a major metropolitan area in the mid-Atlantic states 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Study shows that nursing students interpret as uncivil many of the same behaviors identified s uncivil by faculty. Students shared same concern as faculty when it came to the increasing frequency of uncivil behaviors by students in learning environment.
3	Anthony et al. (2014)	"Development and validation of a tool to measure incivility in clinical nursing education.—UBCNE development"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cross-sectional design Uncivil Behavior in Clinical Nursing Education (UBCNE) tool Principal Components Analysis (PCA) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 106 participants 89 were females 16 were males 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Indicated high degrees of reported stress correlated with high levels of perceived incivility. Suggest that the UBCNE is an easy-to-administer tool with good internal consistency.
4	Babenko-Mould and Laschinger (2014)	"Incivility in Clinical Practice Settings on Nursing Student Burnout"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cross-sectional design 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 190 were recruited Only 126 students participated 123 were females 3 were males 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Incivility in the clinical setting had a negative effect on students. Recommendations: students should practice how to respond to incivility. Clinical instructors should advocate for students.
5	Thomas et al. (2015)	"Finessing incivility: The professional socialisation experiences of student nurses' first clinical placement, a grounded theory"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Focus group method Students were asked to journal their clinical experience and then they were reviewed for patterns of psychosocial effects of incivility 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 30 students who were exposed to 30 clinicals Only 16 students completed a diaries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Most of the participants experienced early in their clinical placement "disillusionment and/or disappointment with the reality of the clinical environment." Student learned to navigate the issue of incivility by recognizing stress and difficulties of the nurses' job and were understanding and forgiving. Students found alternate personnel to observe and shadow (sometimes outside of nursing), quietly stood their ground, and retained strong ethics while implementing evidence-based learning skills despite actions in the clinical environment that were contrary to those teachings. Students need to be allowed access to staff conversations to gain meaningful access to nursing/specialty culture and have a beneficial learning experience. Conclusion: Learning to be a nurse not simple and can be "unpleasant." Students displayed resilience and finesse in the face of adversity.
6	Wallace et al. (2015)	"Perceptions of clinical stress in baccalaureate nursing students"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Quantitative research A survey was used and open-ended questions was used to analyze themes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 65 BSN students Midwestern University At least 1 year of clinicals 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are many stressors in a clinical setting including fear, incivility, inconsistency, time constraint, being unprepared/doing something new or unfamiliar/making a mistake and behaviors of healthcare staff and instructors/teachers toward students.
7	Birks et al. (2017)	"Uncovering degrees of workplace bullying: A comparison of baccalaureate nursing students' experiences during clinical placement in Australia and the UK"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Used the Student Experience of Bullying during Clinical Placement (SEBDP) questionnaire The questionnaire consisted of 13 main questions with more than 80 items which included a rating to determine frequency of occurrence. IBM-SPSS 23 tool used to analyze data from both countries. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 833 Australian students and 561 United Kingdom students For Australian participants, there were 731 females and 96 males For UK participants, there were 517 females and 44 males Participants were drawn from heads of Schools of Nursing across Australia and the rest were from one third of nursing schools in the UK 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Various occurrences of incivility against nursing students in the clinical setting were observed. Most stemmed from RNs, staff from hospital, and patients. Demographics seem to affect the rate of which students are harassed. Males, black nursing students, and those who do not speak English as their first language face more incidences of bullying. Australia had a significantly higher rate of bullying than UK.

Discussions

▶ **Limitations:**

- ▶ Small sample size
- ▶ Lack of alternative perspective
- ▶ Absence of different settings
- ▶ Degree level
- ▶ Accuracy of self report

▶ **Demographics**

- ▶ Men exposed to increased bullying
- ▶ Persons who spoke English as second language were subject increased incivility

▶ **Suggestions:**

- ▶ UBCNE tool (Anthony et al., 2014)
- ▶ Rasch Model tool (Wallace, 2015)

Conclusions

▶ Incivility in Nursing Clinical Education

- ▶ There is a high correlation between students experiencing incivility and dissatisfaction in the clinical experience and disillusionment
- ▶ The idealized practice environments from the lecture setting and the harsh, “dog-eat-dog” nature of the environments experienced by students creates incongruities and confusion
- ▶ The ANA and The Joint Commission have identified hostilities in the work place as pervasive issue contributing to sentinel events and poor patient outcomes
 - ▶ Examining root causes to prevent future occurrences is key. This becomes more abstract when discussing incivility as a cause.
- ▶ While our study examined incivility from all healthcare personnel greatest number of offences directed at nursing students came from registered nurses
 - ▶ The effects of eating our young – nursing shortage; teaching and ingraining incivility as a social norm within nursing
- ▶ Clinical instructors must be cognizant of the nurses with whom their students will be working. It should be made clear to the students early that incivility on the part of hospital staff is inappropriate and should be reported to the clinical instructor.

References

- ▶ Altmiller, G. (2012). Student perceptions of incivility in nursing education: Implications for educators. *Nursing Education Perspectives (National League for Nursing)*, 33(1), 15–20. <https://doi-org.libproxy.lib.csusb.edu/10.5480/1536-5026-33.1.15>
- ▶ American Nurses Association, (2015) Code of Ethics for Nurses, with Interpretive Statements, Silver Spring, MD: American Nurses Association, Nursebooks.org, publishers.
- ▶ Andersson, L. M., & Pearson, C. M. (1999). Tit for Tat? The Spiraling Effect of Incivility in the Workplace. *Academy of Management Review*, 24(3), 452-471. doi:10.5465/amr.1999.2202131
- ▶ Anthony, M., Yastik, J., MacDonald, D. A., & Marshall, K. A. (2014). Development and validation of a tool to measure incivility in clinical nursing education. *Journal of Professional Nursing*, 30(1), 48-55. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.profnurs.2012.12.011>
- ▶ Anthony, M., & Yastik, J. (2011). Nursing students' experiences with incivility in clinical education. *Journal of Nursing Education*, 50(3), 140–144. <https://doi-org.libproxy.lib.csusb.edu/10.3928/01484834-20110131-04>
- ▶ Babenko-Mould, Y., & Laschinger, H. (2014). Effects of incivility in clinical practice settings on nursing student burnout. *International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship*, 11(1), 145-154. doi: 10.1515/ijnes-2014-0023
- ▶ Brennan, G., & Mcsherry, R. (2007). Exploring the transition and professional socialisation from health care assistant to student nurse. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 7(4), 206-214. doi:10.1016/j.nepr.2006.08.006

References

- ▶ Birks, M. M. birks@jcu.edu.au., Cant, R. P., Budden, L. M., Russell-Westhead, M., Sinem Üzar Özçetin, Y., & Tee, S. (2017). Uncovering degrees of workplace bullying: A comparison of baccalaureate nursing students' experiences during clinical placement in Australia and the UK. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 25, 14–21. <https://doi-org.libproxy.lib.csusb.edu/10.1016/j.nepr.2017.04.011>
- ▶ Clark, C. M., & Kenaley, B. L. (2011). Faculty empowerment of students to foster civility in nursing education: A merging of two conceptual models. *Nursing Outlook*, 59(3), 158-165. doi:10.1016/j.outlook.2010.12.005
- ▶ Thomas J., Jinks A., & Jack B. (2015). Finessing incivility: The professional socialisation experiences of student nurses' first clinical placement, a grounded theory. *Nurse Education Today*, 35(12), E4-E9. doi: 10.1016/j.nedt.2015.08.022
- ▶ Wallace, L., Bourke, M. P., Tormoehlen, L. J., & Poe-Greskamp, M. V. (2015). Perceptions of clinical stress in baccalaureate nursing students. *International Journal of Nursing Education Scholarship (IJNES)*, 12(1), 91–98. <https://doi-org.libproxy.lib.csusb.edu/10.1515/ijnes-2014-0056>
- ▶ Spector, N. (2009). Clinical Education and Regulation. In Ard, N. & Valiga, T.(Eds.), *Clinical Nursing Education: Current Reflections* (181 - 198). New York: National League.